

A related incident:

רב איקלע לבי גניבא וצלי של שבת בערב שבת – Rav visited the house of Geniva and prayed Maariv of the Sabbath on the eve of the Sabbath, and R' Yirmiyah bar Abba, Rav's student, prayed behind Rav. And Rav completed his Prayer and did not disrupt the Prayer of R' Yirmiyah.<sup>31</sup>

The Gemara remarks:

שמע – Learn from this incident three things: שמע מינה תלת – Learn from this that a person may pray Maariv of the Sabbath on the eve of the Sabbath, i.e. on Friday afternoon (after half of *minchah*); ושמע מינה – and learn from this that a student may pray behind his teacher; and learn from this that it is forbidden to pass before those who are praying.

The Gemara comments regarding this last point:

מסייע ליה לרבי יהושע בן לוי – This supports R' Yehoshua ben Levi, דאמר רבי יהושע בן לוי – for R' Yehoshua ben Levi said: אסור לעבור קנגד המתפללין – It is forbidden to pass before those who are praying.<sup>32</sup>

The Gemara questions this ruling:

איני – Is this so? ונהא רבי אמי ורבי אסי חלפי – Why, R' Ami and R' Assi would pass before one who was praying! – ? –

The Gemara answers:

רבי אמי ורבי אסי חוץ לארבע אמות הוא דחלפי – R' Ami and R' Assi would pass only beyond four *amos* of the person.

In the incident cited above, the Gemara related that R' Yirmiyah prayed while standing in back of his teacher. The Gemara wonders about this:

ורבי ירמיה היכי עביר הכי – How could R' Yirmiyah do this? ונהא אמר רב יהודה אמר רב – Why, Rav Yehudah said in the name of Rav: לעולם אל יתפלל אדם – A person should never pray

#### NOTES

This is where the opportunity to pray with a *minyan* is in jeopardy. If a congregation prayed *Minchah* after *plag haminchah*, and it is likely that if they wait until dark to recite Maariv some of their members will go home and leave the synagogue without a *minyan*, they may pray Maariv directly after *Minchah* (*Mishnah Berurah* *ibid.* See also *Mishnah Berurah* 267:3 with *Beur Halachah* [ר"ה ובפ"ג]).

31. Rav prayed facing the wall and R' Yirmiyah stood behind him and a little bit off to the side (either to the right or the left). When Rav

completed his *Shemoneh Esrei*, he did not pass between R' Yirmiyah who was still in middle of his *Shemoneh Esrei*, and the wall, in order to return to his seat [which was on the other side of R' Yirmiyah]. Rather he stood in his place (*Rashi*, as understood by *Magen Avraham* 102:7 – see *Machatzis HaShekel* in the name of *Chemed Moshe*; cf. *Beis Yosef* end of *siman* 102 in the name of *Orchos Chaim*).

32. Because doing so upsets their concentration (*Mishnah Berurah* 102:15; see there for an alternative reason).

ולא – neither alongside his [Torah] teacher<sup>[1]</sup> – לא כנגד רבו  
 – nor behind his [Torah] teacher.<sup>[2]</sup> ותניא – And  
 similarly it was taught in a Baraisa: רבי אליעזר אומר – R'  
 ELIEZER SAYS: המתפלל אחורי רבו – ONE WHO PRAYS BEHIND HIS  
 [TORAH] TEACHER, והנותן שלום לרבו – AND ONE WHO GREETES HIS  
 [TORAH] TEACHER as he would an ordinary person,<sup>[3]</sup> והמתחזיר  
 שלום לרבו – AND ONE WHO RETURNS A GREETING TO HIS [TORAH]  
 TEACHER as he would to an ordinary person, והחולק על ושיבתו  
 – AND ONE WHO CHALLENGES THE ACADEMY OF HIS  
 [TORAH] TEACHER,<sup>[4]</sup> והאומר דבר שלא שמע מפי רבו – AND ONE  
 WHO SAYS SOMETHING THAT HE DID NOT HEAR FROM HIS [TORAH]  
 TEACHER<sup>[5]</sup> גורם לשכינה שתסתלק מישׂראל – CAUSES THE DIVINE  
 PRESENCE TO DEPART FROM ISRAEL.

The Gemara replies:

R' Yirmiyah bar Abba was different, שאני רבי ירמיה בר אבא  
 – R' Yirmiyah bar Abba was different, ותלמיד חכם היה – for he was a student who was equal to Rav in  
 knowledge.<sup>[6]</sup> והיינו דקאמר ליה רבי ירמיה בר אבא לרב – And this  
 is the explanation of what R' Yirmiyah bar Abba said to Rav  
 when Rav prayed the Sabbath evening Maariv on Friday after-  
 noon: מי בך דלת? – “Have you abstained from work?” i.e. having  
 accepted upon yourself the Sabbath by reciting the Sabbath Prayer,  
 are you also refraining from performing labor?<sup>[7]</sup> אמר ליה אין  
 – And [Rav] replied: “Yes, I have abstained,” – וירמיה בר אבא  
 – and [R' Yirmiyah bar Abba] did not say: מי בך דלת? – “Has  
 master abstained?”<sup>[8]</sup>

The Gemara asks:

And did [Rav] actually abstain from work after  
 praying? ותאמר רבי אבין – But R' Avin said: פתח אחת התפלל  
 – One time Rabbi prayed Maariv of the Sabbath on the eve of the Sabbath, i.e. on Friday afternoon,  
 and afterwards he entered the bathhouse ונכנס למרחץ ויצא  
 – and taught us our lesson, ושנה לן פרוקין – and it had not yet become dark. From the fact that  
 Rabbi entered the bathhouse after having prayed Maariv, we see  
 that praying Maariv early on Friday afternoon does not obligate

one to refrain from labor.<sup>[9]</sup> – ? –

The Gemara answers:

הוא דנכנס להויע וקודם גזירה הנה – That  
 case was where he entered the bathhouse to steam-bathe, and  
 it was before the Rabbinic decree prohibiting use of a steam  
 room on the Sabbath.

The Gemara continues to ask:

Is it really so that after reciting the Sabbath evening prayer  
 on Friday afternoon one must desist from work? והא אביו שרא  
 – But Abaye permitted Rav  
 Dimi bar Leivai to sulfurate baskets after reciting the Sabbath  
 evening Prayer on Friday afternoon.<sup>[10]</sup> – ? –

The Gemara answers:

הוא שעותא הוה – That case was different, for Rav Dimi had  
 prayed Maariv early in error.<sup>[11]</sup> Rav, however, had willingly  
 accepted upon himself the Sabbath early.

The Gemara asks:

And is an acceptance of the Sabbath made in  
 error reversible? והא אמר אביו – But Avidan said: פעם  
 אחת נתקשרו שמים בעבים – Once on Sabbath afternoon the sky  
 thickened with clouds, and the people thought to say that it was nighttime,  
 and they entered the synagogue and prayed Maariv of the conclusion of the Sabbath  
 on the Sabbath. – ונתפזרו העבים ונראה החמה – Subsequently  
 the clouds dispersed and the sun shone forth and the people  
 realized their error. וכאו ושאלו את רבי – They came and asked  
 Rabbi whether they needed to repeat Maariv after nightfall,  
 and he said: Once they have  
 prayed, they have prayed. Thus we see that a Maariv Prayer  
 recited early in error still counts as a prayer. Accordingly, since  
 Rav Dimi bar Leivai recited the Sabbath evening Maariv on Friday  
 afternoon, albeit in error, it should count as a valid prayer through  
 which he accepted upon himself the Sabbath.<sup>[12]</sup> Why, then, did  
 Abaye permit him to sulfurate the baskets?

#### NOTES

1. For by doing so he makes it appear as if he were his teacher's equal (*Rashi*).

2. The reason here is also because of haughtiness (*Rashi*; see *Yoma* 37a). [Others say it is because when he bows during *Shemoneh Esrei* it appears as if he is bowing to his teacher (*Tosafos*), or because if he is standing in back of his teacher it will cause his teacher anguish, since his teacher will be prevented from taking the three steps back upon completing *Shemoneh Esrei* (*Rabbeinu Yonah*).] See *Orach Chaim* 102:4.

3. The definition of a Torah teacher in this context is a person from whom the student has learned most of his Torah knowledge or, alternatively, a recognized Torah giant of the generation (*Chayei Adam* 22:6). See *Shulchan Aruch, Orach Chaim* 90:24 for the parameters of these laws.

4. I.e. he greets his teacher with the words שלום עליך, *Peace upon you*, instead of with the more respectful רבי עליך, *Peace upon you, my teacher* (*Rashi*; cf. *Rabbeinu Yonah*).

5. I.e. he sets up an academy and gives Torah lectures without the permission of his Torah teacher (see *Rambam, Hil. Talmud Torah* 5:2 and *Yoreh Deah* 242:3 with commentators).

6. When someone states a Torah thought, people automatically assume that he is repeating what he heard from his Torah teacher. Therefore, if he says something which he did not hear from his teacher, he must state the name of the person from whom he heard it (*Beis Yosef to Yoreh Deah* 242 explaining *Rambam*), so that if people question what he said and attribute it to his Torah teacher, it will not come as an embarrassment to his Torah teacher (*Divrei Chamudos* §24).

7. Others explain this phrase to mean that he says something which he never heard from his Torah teacher in the name of his Torah teacher (*Rabbeinu Yonah, Rosh*).

8. Literally: a student-colleague, i.e. someone who is as knowledgeable as the person in question [חבר, *colleague*], but learned one or more laws from him [תלמיד, *student*] (*Rashi to Eruvin* 63a; cf. *Rash-*

*bam to Bava Basra* 158b; *Rambam, Hil. Talmud Torah* 5:9).

9. [R' Yirmiyah himself, although he had prayed at the same time as Rav, had prayed the weekday Minchah (*Behag*, cited by *Gilyon HaShas* to 27a). He therefore asked Rav, who had prayed the Sabbath Maariv, if he was abstaining from work.]

10. Had R' Yirmiyah been only a student of Rav, he would not have spoken to him in the familiar second person, but would have addressed him as “master.” And since he was considered Rav's peer as well, he was permitted to pray behind him.

11. The Gemara in *Shabbos* (40a) relates that originally, before the Sages forbade bathing in hot water on the Sabbath, people would bathe in hot water that had been heated before the Sabbath. When the Sages saw that bathhouse attendants began heating the baths on the Sabbath and claiming that they were heated before the Sabbath, the Sages forbade bathing in any hot water on the Sabbath, but they still allowed steam-bathing (perspiring in a sauna without actually putting water on oneself). But people would still bathe in the bathhouses on the Sabbath in water heated from before the Sabbath, in violation of the injunction, and when apprehended would say that they were merely steam-bathing. The Sages therefore forbade even steam-bathing.

12. In its question, the Gemara assumes the incident with Rabbi occurred after the injunction which forbade bathing and steam-bathing (*Rashi*).

10. Fumes of burning sulfur were sometimes used for coloring or tempering objects (see *Shabbos* 18a with *Rashi* גפריית, *Sotah* 49b with *Rashi* ריח של מלח, *Bava Basra* 97b with *Rashbam* פיסטות).

11. It was a cloudy day and, thinking that it was already nighttime, Rav Dimi bar Leivai had recited the Sabbath evening prayer. The clouds then dispersed and the sun came out, and he realized his mistake (*Rashi*).

12. Although Rabbi certainly did not permit the people to perform *melachah* before dark, that is because praying early cannot remove Sabbath restrictions. However, with regard to *adding on* to the Sabbath,