

More rules regarding compensatory prayers:

טענה ולא התפלל – The Rabbis taught in a Baraisa: תנו רבנן – If one erred and did not pray Minchah on the eve of the Sabbath, i.e. on Friday afternoon, מתפלל בלילה – He prays twice on the Sabbath night, once for Maariv and once to make up for Minchah.^[1]
 טענה ולא התפלל מנחה בשבת – If one erred and did not recite Minchah on the Sabbath, מתפלל במוצאי שבת של חול – He prays at the conclusion of the Sabbath, i.e. on Saturday night, TWO OF THE WEEKDAY, i.e. two weekday texts of the Prayer, one for Maariv and one to make up for Minchah.^[2]
 מבריל בשניה – He recites Havdalah in the first Prayer but he does not recite Havdalah in the second.^[3]
 ואם הבדיל בשניה ולא הבדיל בראשונה – And if he recited Havdalah in the second Prayer but he did not recite Havdalah in the first, שניה עלתה לו – The second one counts for him, ראשונה לא עלתה לו – and the first one does not count for him.^[4]

The Gemara asks:

למימרא דכינן דלא אבריל בקמייתא – Is this to say that since he did not recite Havdalah in the first Prayer במאן דלא עלי דמי

– it is as if he did not pray it and we make him repeat it?^[5] ורמינהו – But contrast [this Baraisa with another] and note the contradiction: גבורות גשמים בתהיית טענה ולא הזכיר גבורות גשמים בתהיית – If one erred and did not mention the powers of rain in the blessing of THE RESURRECTION OF THE DEAD,^[6] ושאלה בברכת השנים – OR THE REQUEST for rain in THE BLESSING OF THE YEARS,^[7] מחזירין אותו – WE MAKE HIM RETURN and repeat the *Shemoneh Esrei*.^[8] הבדלה בחונן הרצח – However, if he forgot to recite HAVDALAH in the blessing GRACIOUS GIVER OF WISDOM,^[9] אין מחזירין אותו – WE DO NOT MAKE HIM RETURN, מפני שיכול לאומרה על הכוס – FOR HE IS ABLE TO SAY [HAVDALAH] later OVER THE CUP of wine.^[10] Thus we see that the omission of Havdalah does not invalidate the *Shemoneh Esrei*. – ? –

The Gemara concludes:

קשיא – This is indeed a difficulty.^[11]

The Gemara discusses the origin of the three daily Prayers: רבי יוסי ברבי חנינא אמר – R' Yose the son of R' Chanina said: תפלות אבות תקנום – The prayers were instituted by the Patriarchs.^[12] רבי יהושע בן לוי אמר – R' Yehoshua ben Levi said: תפלות כנגד המידין תקנום – The

NOTES

1. He recites the Sabbath text of the *Shemoneh Esrei* both times. For the reason the Sabbath Prayers were shortened from eighteen blessings to seven was that the Sages wished to make the Sabbath Prayers simpler and less burdensome (see above, 21a). Accordingly, whenever one prays on the Sabbath, even if he is making up for a weekday Prayer, he recites the Sabbath text (*Ritva*; see also *Hagahos HaGra*).

2. Although he is making up for a Sabbath Prayer, he still recites the weekday text of the *Shemoneh Esrei*. For even on the Sabbath itself the *Shemoneh Esrei* should have been identical to the weekday one [with just an appropriate paragraph included to indicate the holiness of the day, as is done on Rosh Chodesh and Chol HaMoed by adding *וְיָבֵא* by adding *וְיָבֵא*]. As mentioned, however, the Sages wished to make the Sabbath Prayer less burdensome. Accordingly, where the person is making up for a Sabbath Prayer after the Sabbath, the reason no longer applies, and he recites the weekday text of the *Shemoneh Esrei* (*Ritva*; see *Tosafos*).

3. [Havdalah here refers to the *אָתָּה חוֹנֵנוּ* prayer inserted into the fourth blessing of the *Shemoneh Esrei* of Maariv at the conclusion of the Sabbath, to signify the differentiation between the Sabbath and the other days of the week.] When compensating for a missed *tefillah*, the first *Shemoneh Esrei* is always recited for the current obligation and the second for the missed one. [For possible reasons for this, see *Maadanei Yom Tov* §400; *Aruch HaShulchan* 108:9; *Mishnah Berurah* 108:7.] Accordingly, when compensating on Saturday night for a missed Sabbath Minchah Prayer, one adds Havdalah to the first *Shemoneh Esrei*, since this one is for the current Maariv obligation, but not to the second *Shemoneh Esrei*, since this is the compensatory Prayer (see *Rashi*).

[This is unlike the law in the first case in which one is compensating for a missed weekday Prayer on the Sabbath, where we learned that one recites the exact same *Shemoneh Esrei* both times. This is because Havdalah is not part of the Saturday night *Shemoneh Esrei* per se, but is merely inserted into that *Shemoneh Esrei* to differentiate between the holiness of the Sabbath and the weekday. Accordingly, once it is recited in the first *Shemoneh Esrei* and the differentiation has been made, there is no reason to recite it again in the second *Shemoneh Esrei* (*Maadanei Yom Tov* §200).]

4. The second *Shemoneh Esrei* counts as Maariv, while the first *Shemoneh Esrei* does not count at all. The person must therefore recite a third *Shemoneh Esrei* to make up for Minchah.

The reason for this is as follows: When he recited the first of the two *Shemoneh Esreis*, he presumably had in mind that he was doing so to fulfill his current Maariv obligation, for the rule is that one must always recite the current obligation first. However, since he did not add Havdalah, which he was required to do for the Maariv Prayer, it does not count for him.

He then recited the second *Shemoneh Esrei*. [Although he has not yet fulfilled his Maariv obligation, and we have learned that the present obligation must always be discharged first, in this case where he in fact intended the first *Shemoneh Esrei* for the current obligation, but did not

fulfill it because of a halachic technicality (i.e. he forgot Havdalah), he theoretically can recite the second *Shemoneh Esrei* for his make-up (see *Rashash*). However] by adding Havdalah to this second *Shemoneh Esrei*, he has indicated that he is in fact reciting this *Shemoneh Esrei* for his current obligation (presumably because he realized that he had forgotten Havdalah in the first *Shemoneh Esrei*). It therefore does not count as a compensatory prayer, but, indeed, for the present obligation. Accordingly, he must now recite *Shemoneh Esrei* a third time to make up for the Sabbath Minchah Prayer (*Rashi*, as explained by *Hagahos HaBa*; for other explanations of *Rashi*'s commentary here see *Leshon HaZahav*, *Divrei David* and *Emes LeYaakov*; cf. *Ritva*).

5. As explained in the previous note, the reason the first *Shemoneh Esrei* does not count for his Maariv obligation was because he left out Havdalah. Thus, the Baraisa must be assuming that omitting Havdalah in the Saturday night *Shemoneh Esrei* invalidates that Prayer.

6. That is, he neglected during the winter months to mention the phrase *מְשִׁיב רָיחַ וּמוֹרִיד הַגֶּשֶׁם*, *He makes the wind blow and the rain descend*, in the second blessing of the *Shemoneh Esrei*, which speaks about the resurrection of the dead.

7. That is, during the rainy season he did not mention the phrase *עַל טַל וְקָדַר*, *and give dew and rain*, in the ninth blessing of *Shemoneh Esrei* which concludes *Blessed are You, Hashem, Who blesses the years*.

8. [For the details of these laws see *Orach Chaim* 114:5 and 117:4.]

9. That is, on Saturday night he did not add the Havdalah prayer into the fourth blessing of *Shemoneh Esrei*, which is the blessing asking God for wisdom.

10. Since Havdalah is recited a second time over a cup of wine, there is no need to repeat *Shemoneh Esrei* if one left out Havdalah there. [As to why Havdalah is recited twice, see below, 33a.]

11. Although the Gemara leaves this difficulty unresolved, the fact that the Gemara concludes with the expression *קָשְׁיָא*, a difficulty, rather than with the more forceful expression *תִּיבְתָא*, a refutation, indicates that the Gemara does not mean to reject the Baraisa's ruling, but means only to state that it cannot at present resolve the difficulty it raised with the ruling (see *Rav Hai Gaon* cited by *Rosh*; see also *Rashi* to *Sanhedrin* 71b; cf. *Rashbam* to *Bava Basra* 52b קשיא דר"ה; cf. *Rashbam* to *Shulchan Aruch* (*Orach Chaim* 108:10) is in accord with the Baraisa. Moreover, *Rav Hai Gaon* offers a plausible reason for the Baraisa's ruling: By reciting Havdalah in the second *Shemoneh Esrei* [but not in the first], the person indicated that he intended the first Prayer as his make-up and the second for the current obligation. Since a make-up may never precede a current obligation, the first Prayer is invalid and the person must recite the make-up Prayer a second time.

12. As a Baraisa below will explain (*Rashi*). [This does not mean that the Patriarchs composed the text of the *Shemoneh Esrei* as we have it, for this was formulated many generations later by the *תַּנְחַמְדִּים*, *Megillah* 17b-18a). Rather, the Patriarchs

prayers were instituted by the Men of the Great Assembly corresponding to the daily *tamid* offerings.^[13]

The Gemara adduces Tannaic support for each of these views: תניא ברבי יוסי ברבי חנינא – A Baraisa was taught in accordance with the opinion of R' Yose the son of R' Chanina and a Baraisa was taught in accordance with the opinion of R' Yehoshua ben Levi.

The Gemara cites the first Baraisa:

A Baraisa was taught in accordance with the opinion of R' Yose the son of R' Chanina: ABRAHAM INSTITUTED THE SHACHARIS PRAYER, AS IT IS STATED: וישכם אברהם בבקר – AND ABRAHAM AROSE EARLY IN THE MORNING TO THE PLACE WHERE HE HAD STOOD.^[14] ואין עמידה אלא – AND “STANDING” in this verse REFERS TO NOTHING OTHER THAN PRAYER, AS IT IS STATED elsewhere: וישמר – AND PINCHAS STOOD UP AND PRAYED.^[15] ויצחק תקן – ISAAC INSTITUTED THE MINCHAH PRAYER, AS IT IS STATED: ויצא יצחק לשוח בשדה לפני ערב – AND ISAAC WENT OUT TO SPEAK IN THE FIELD TOWARDS EVENING.^[16] ואין שיחה אלא תפלה – AND “SPEECH” in this verse MEANS NOTHING OTHER THAN PRAYER, AS IT IS STATED elsewhere: א תפלה לפני ביי יעסוף – A PRAYER OF THE AFFLICTED MAN WHEN HE SWOONS, – AND BEFORE HASHEM HE POURS FORTH HIS SPEECH.^[17] יעקב תקן תפלת ערבית – JACOB INSTITUTED THE MAARIV PRAYER, AS IT IS STATED: ויפגע – AND HE ENCOUNTERED (*vayifga*) THE PLACE AND SPENT THE NIGHT THERE.^[18] ואין פגיעה אלא תפלה – AND the term *PEGIAH* in this verse REFERS TO NOTHING OTHER THAN PRAYER, AS IT IS STATED: ואל תשאו בשרים רגה ותפלה – AND YOU, DO NOT PRAY FOR THIS PEOPLE, – AND DO NOT TAKE UP FOR THEM A CRY AND A PRAYER, AND DO NOT ENTREAT (*tifga*) ME.^[19]

The Gemara cites the second Baraisa:

And a Baraisa was taught in accordance with the opinion of R' Yehoshua ben Levi: מפיני מה – WHY DID THEY SAY THAT THE MORNING PRAYER may be recited UNTIL NOON? שהרי תמיד של שחר קרב – BECAUSE THE MORNING TAMID MAY BE OFFERED ALL ALONG UNTIL NOON.^[20] ורבי יהודה אומר – AND R' YEHUDAH SAYS: עד ארבע שעות – The morning Prayer may be recited only UNTIL FOUR HOURS into the day, והולך קרב והולך – FOR THE MORNING TAMID MAY BE OFFERED ANY TIME UNTIL FOUR HOURS into the day.^[21] ומפיני מה אמרו תפלת – AND WHY DID THEY SAY THAT THE AFTERNOON PRAYER may be recited UNTIL THE EVENING? שהרי תמיד של בין – FOR THE AFTERNOON TAMID MAY BE OFFERED ANY TIME UNTIL THE EVENING. רבי יהודה אומר – R' YEHUDAH SAYS: עד פלג המנחה – The afternoon Prayer may be recited only UNTIL HALF OF *MINCHAH*,^[22] שהרי תמיד של בין – FOR THE AFTERNOON TAMID MAY BE OFFERED ANY TIME UNTIL HALF OF *MINCHAH*. ומפיני מה אמרו – AND WHY DID THEY SAY THAT THE EVENING PRAYER DOES NOT HAVE A FIXED TIME, i.e. may be recited all night long? שהרי אברים ופדרים – FOR THE LIMBS AND FATS OF sacrifices whose blood was sprinkled on the Altar before sunset – שלא נתעבלו מבשר – but WHICH WERE NOT CONSUMED by the Altar's fire BEFORE EVENING – קרבים והולכים כל הלילה – MAY BE OFFERED on the Altar ALL NIGHT LONG.^[23] ומפיני מה אמרו – AND WHY DID THEY SAY THAT [THE PRAYER] OF MUSSAF may be recited ALL DAY? שהרי קרבן של מוספין קרב כל היום – FOR THE MUSSAF SACRIFICE MAY BE OFFERED ALL DAY. רבי יהודה אומר – R' YEHUDAH SAYS: עד שבע שעות – The Mussaf Prayer may be recited only UNTIL SEVEN HOURS into the day, שהרי קרבן מוסף קרב והולך עד שבע שעות – FOR THE MUSSAF SACRIFICE MAY BE OFFERED ALL ALONG UNTIL SEVEN HOURS.

The Baraisa continues:

ואיזו היא מנחה גדולה – AND WHEN IS *MINCHAH GEDOLAH*?^[24]

NOTES

merely established that one *should* pray three times daily, in whichever manner he chooses (*Maharsha*.)

13. This too will be explained in a Baraisa.

14. *Genesis* 19:27.

15. *Psalms* 106:30 (see *Targum* there; cf. commentators ad loc.). Accordingly, the verse means that Abraham arose early in the morning and went to the place where he had previously prayed.

16. *Genesis* 24:63.

17. *Psalms* 102:1. Accordingly, the verse means that Isaac went out to pray in the field toward evening (the time of the afternoon prayer).

[The question arises: By saying that Isaac established Minchah, the Gemara implies that until Isaac's time no one recited that prayer. However, the Gemara in *Yoma* (28b) states that Abraham did recite Minchah.

Some answer that after Isaac established Minchah, Abraham also recited it (*Tosafos* here and *Tos. Yeshanim* to *Yoma* ibid.). Alternatively, while Abraham prayed Minchah on a voluntary basis, Isaac fixed it as an obligation (*Tos. Yeshanim* ibid.; cf. *Maharsha* in the name of *Sefer Yochasin*.)

18. *Genesis* 28:11.

19. *Jeremiah* 7:16. *Tifga* and *vayifga* derive from the same root (נפג).

[Some explain that according to the present interpretation of ויפגע as *and he prayed*, the word נפג is interpreted as a reference to God by His designation מקום, *Omnipresent* [literally: The Place]. Accordingly, the expression נפגע במקום would be rendered: *And he prayed to* (or: *entreated*) *the Omnipresent* (*Mizrachi* ad loc.). Others, however, say that even according to this interpretation the word נפגע is understood in its plain meaning of “place.” Accordingly, the expression נפגע במקום means: *And he prayed at the place* (*Maharsha* to *Chullin* 91b; see also *Targum Yonasan* to *Genesis* ibid.)]

20. The Torah requires that two lambs be sacrificed as *olah* offerings each day [including the Sabbath and Yom Tov], one in the morning and

one in the afternoon (see *Numbers* 28:1-8). These offerings are called *tamid*, “continual” offerings, for they are offered day in and day out without interruption. With regard to the morning *tamid* Scripture states: את־הקֹּבֶשׂ אֶחָד תַּעֲשֶׂה בַבֶּקֶר, *The one lamb shall you make in the morning* (ibid v. 4). The Sages hold that “morning” extends until noon (*Gemara* below, 27a).

21. R' Yehudah maintains that “morning” does not extend beyond the fourth hour (ibid.).

22. The Gemara will explain this.

23. [Sacrifices may not be offered at night. Nevertheless] if the blood of a sacrifice was thrown on the Altar before dark, its limbs, in the case of an *olah* offering, and its fats, in the case of other offerings, may be placed on the Altar's fire even after nightfall. Corresponding to the burning of these fats and limbs, the Sages instituted the Maariv Prayer (*Rashi*).

[*Rashi* implies that the Maariv service corresponds to the burning of the limbs and fats of offerings in general. Accordingly, when R' Yehoshua ben Levi stated that the prayers were instituted “corresponding to the *tamid* offerings,” we must say that he was referring to two out of three of the prayers [i.e. Shacharis and Minchah]. *Rambam* (*Hil. Tefillah* 1:6) and *Tur* (*Orach Chaim* 235), however, state that Maariv corresponds to the burning of the limbs [and fats] remaining from the afternoon *tamid*. According to this approach, R' Yehoshua ben Levi's statement refers to all three of the prayers.]

24. The afternoon period is divided into two parts: the earlier portion, called *minchah gedolah*, “greater minchah” [because the greater portion of the day remains – see *Perishah*, *Orach Chaim* 232:5], and the latter portion, known as *minchah ketanah*, “lesser minchah” [because only a small portion of the day remains]. The start of *minchah gedolah* coincides with the earliest time that the afternoon *tamid* may be offered, while *minchah ketanah* commences with the time at which the afternoon *tamid* was actually offered in the Temple. The Baraisa inquires as to when the period of *minchah gedolah* is.