

It appears from this Baraisa that one must recite the morning Prayer immediately following sunrise.<sup>[8]</sup> This contradicts the rulings of both the Rabbis and R' Yehudah, who permit reciting Shacharis well into the day. – ? –

The Gemara answers:

– **That Baraisa was taught specifically in reference to the devoted ones**, who go beyond the letter of the law in their performance of mitzvos.<sup>[9]</sup> – **For R' Yochanan said:** – **The devoted ones would take care to complete the recitation of [the Shema] together with the sunrise.**<sup>[10]</sup> Our Mishnah, however, refers to ordinary people, who are content to perform the mitzvos according to the letter of the law. The Mishnah teaches that the latest one may recite the morning Prayer and still fulfill the mitzvah is noon (according to the Rabbis) or four hours into the day (according to R' Yehudah).

The Gemara asks:

– **And everyone else**, i.e. those who are not categorized as “devoted ones,” may recite Shacharis only until noon, but not later? – **But Rav Mari the son of Rav Huna the son of R' Yirmiyah bar Abba said in the name of R' Yochanan:** – **If one erred and did not recite Maariv, he recites two Prayers at Shacharis**, one for Shacharis and one to compensate for Maariv; – **if he erred and did not recite Shacharis, he recites two Prayers at Minchah.** Since we find that one may compensate for a missed Shacharis by adding a Prayer in the afternoon, it is clear that the time for Shacharis is not limited to before noon.<sup>[11]</sup> – ? –

The Gemara answers:

– **In truth one may pray Shacharis all day long.** However, – **until noon he is given reward for Prayer in its proper time;** – **thereafter he is given reward for Prayer,** – **but he is not given reward for Prayer in its proper time.**

Having mentioned the law of compensating for a missed Prayer, the Gemara discusses the scope of this allowance:

– **They inquired:** – **If one erred and did not recite Minchah, may he recite two Prayers at Maariv to compensate for his omission?** – **If you will respond and say that we can derive the answer from the case in which one erred and did not recite Maariv, where R' Yochanan ruled that he prays twice at Shacharis, and you will argue that here too he should be permitted to compensate for having missed Minchah by reciting an extra Prayer at Maariv, there is, however, a difference.** – **For there it is all one day**, i.e. the evening and morning both form part of the same day, – **as it is written: And there was evening and there was morning, one day.**<sup>[12]</sup> – **But here,** in the case of one who missed the Minchah Prayer and wishes to compensate for it by reciting an extra Prayer in the evening, perhaps he may not do so, because – **Prayer is in place of a sacrifice,** – **and we have a rule that once the day of [a sacrifice] has passed, its sacrifice is canceled.**<sup>[13]</sup> Accordingly, if one misses Minchah and the day ends, he may not compensate for it by reciting two Prayers in the evening, since it is already the next day.<sup>[14]</sup> – **Or perhaps we say that since Prayer is ultimately a request for mercy,** – **whenever one wishes he may pray.**<sup>[15]</sup> – ? –

The Gemara answers:

– **Come, learn the answer:** – **For Rav Huna bar Yehudah said in the name of R' Yitzchak who said in the name of R' Yochanan:** – **If one erred and did not recite Minchah, he recites two Prayers at Maariv, and the maxim “once its day has passed its sacrifice is canceled” does not apply to this.**<sup>[16]</sup>

#### NOTES

*Shemoneh Esrei*), which is not preferred, or to delay beginning *Shemoneh Esrei* until sunrise, thereby creating an undesirable gap between the blessing of redemption and the *Shemoneh Esrei* (see *Tosafos to Yoma* 37b אמר אביי *Milchamos Hashem to Rif* folio 2a; *Rabbeinu Yonah* ibid. folio 4b).

8. For if it is indeed permissible to pray the Shacharis *Shemoneh Esrei* as late as noon or four hours into the day, one could accomplish both of the goals mentioned in the previous note by reciting the *Shema* even after sunrise, and reciting the *Shemoneh Esrei* at that point.

9. “Devoted ones” (*vasikin*) is a term for individuals who cherish the mitzvos and exert themselves to perform them at the earliest possible opportunity and in the most preferred manner (see *Rashi*). [See above, 9b note 34, for other explanations of the term *vasikin*.]

10. In their zeal to perform the mitzvos at the earliest opportunity (מקדימים למעוֹת), the devoted ones would begin the *Shemoneh Esrei* at the earliest possible moment within the time period allotted for this *tefillah*. Since the time for reciting Shacharis runs from sunrise (preferably) until noon or four hours into the day, they would commence *Shemoneh Esrei* at sunrise.

11. [Actually, a rather simple answer to this question would be to say that the Baraisa refers specifically to where one erred, and is giving an instruction for after the fact (בדיוק), while our Mishnah refers to when the Prayer should initially (לכתחילה) be recited. The Gemara, however, offers a different answer [because it assumes the Mishnah's statement to apply to all cases] (*Ritva*; cf. *Maharshal*; *Tzlach*; *Divrei David*).

12. *Genesis* 1:5.

13. I.e. if one missed bringing an offering of a particular day, e.g. a *mussaf* offering, no substitute is brought the next day (*Rashi*).

14. [Although it is also true that if the morning *tamid* is missed it cannot be brought in the afternoon, and yet R' Yochanan states that one may pray twice at Minchah to compensate for a missed Shacharis, this is because the *Shemoneh Esrei* Prayer, in the final analysis, is not an actual *tamid* sacrifice – it only corresponds to one. However, because it does at least correspond to this communal sacrifice, it can be argued that the Rabbis were no more lenient with it than with the law we find in regard to another time-related communal sacrifice – the *mussaf* offering, where the rule is that if it was not brought on its prescribed day, it cannot be made up on the next. Thus while R' Yochanan allows a missed *Shemoneh Esrei* to be made up later within the same day, it is possible that he does not allow it to be made up on the next day (see *Rashash* and *Leshon HaZahav* in explanation of *Rashi*; see also *Pnei Yehoshua*; *Pnei Shlomo*; *Sheleimah Mishnas*).

15. In the final analysis, Prayer is an entreaty that God grant us our needs. Perhaps, therefore, the Rabbis were lenient and allowed us to make up a missed Minchah Prayer at Maariv, despite the fact that no sacrifice can be compensated for on the next day.

16. Some assert, however, that a missed Prayer can be made up only at the time of the following Prayer. Thus if, for example, one missed both Shacharis and Minchah, he prays twice at Maariv, once for Maariv and once for Minchah, but he has lost the chance to make up the Shacharis Prayer (*Tosafos* טעה *Rambam*, *Hil. Tefillah* 3:10). Others maintain that one can make up as many Prayers as have been missed. Hence if, say, one was ill and could not pray for three days, he may upon recovering make up all nine of the Prayers he missed (see *Rabbeinu Yonah*, and see *Raavad* on *Rambam* ibid.). The halachah follows the former view (*Shulchan Aruch*, *Orach Chaim* 108:4; see however ibid. §5 and *Mishnah Berurah* §19).

The Gemara questions R' Yochanan's ruling allowing compensation for missed Prayers:

מֵיחִיבֵי – **They challenged** this ruling from a Baraisa: מֵעֵצָה,, לא־יִוָּכַל לְתַקֵּן – Scripture states: *A TWISTED THING CANNOT BE MADE STRAIGHT*. וְחֶסְרוֹן לֹא־יִוָּכַל לְהַמְנוֹת<sup>[17]</sup> – *AND THAT WHICH IS MISSING CANNOT BE NUMBERED*.<sup>[17]</sup> מֵעֵצָה לֹא־יִוָּכַל לְתַקֵּן,, – *A TWISTED THING CANNOT BE MADE STRAIGHT* – זֶה שֶׁבִטֵּל קְרִיאַת שְׁמַע שֶׁל עֶרְבִית – *THIS REFERS TO ONE WHO SUSPENDED THE READING OF THE EVENING SHEMA* וְקְרִיאַת שְׁמַע שֶׁל שַׁחְרִית – *OR THE READING OF THE MORNING SHEMA*, או תפלה של ערבית – *OR THE EVENING PRAYER OR THE MORNING PRAYER*.<sup>[18]</sup> וְחֶסְרוֹן לֹא־יִוָּכַל לְהַמְנוֹת,, – *AND THAT WHICH IS MISSING CANNOT BE NUMBERED* – זֶה שֶׁנִּמְנוּ חֲבֵירָיו לְדַבֵּר מִצְוָה – *THIS REFERS TO ONE WHOSE FRIENDS WERE COUNTED TO perform A MITZVAH* וְלֹא נִמְנָה עִמָּהֶם – *BUT HE WAS NOT COUNTED AMONG THEM*.<sup>[19]</sup> It is clear from this Baraisa that if one misses a

Prayer "it cannot be made straight," i.e. he cannot compensate for it. – ? –

The Gemara answers:

אָמַר רַבִּי יִצְחָק אָמַר רַבִּי יוֹחָנָן – **R' Yitzchak said in the name of R' Yochanan:** הֲכָא בְמַאי עָסְקִינָן – *Here in the Baraisa with what are we dealing?* שֶׁבִטֵּל בְּמִזְדִּיק – *Where he suspended the Prayer intentionally*. In that case we do not allow him to make it up. However, where his omission was accidental, he may compensate for it.

The Gemara adduces support for this answer:

אָמַר רַב אֲשִׁי – **Rav Ashi said:** דְּוָקָא נָמִי דְקָתְנִי בְטֵל – *This explanation is also indicated by a precise reading of the Baraisa, for the Baraisa states "he suspended" the Prayer, which implies that it was done intentionally, ולא קָתְנִי טָעָה – and it does not state "he erred."* שְׁמַע מִינָּה – *Learn from this as we have said.*

## NOTES

17. Ecclesiastes 1:15.

18. Koheles refers to a missed prayer as a *twisted thing that cannot be made straight*, for the omitted prayer cannot be made up later. This is the basis for the Gemara's question which follows.

19. I.e. he was invited to join a group of people who were going to

perform a mitzvah, e.g. to raise money for a worthy cause or to visit a sick person, and he declined. That opportunity is lost forever ("that which is missing cannot be numbered"), since the mitzvah has already been performed (*Rashi to Chagigah 9b* שְׁמִינִירוֹ). Cf. *Sifsei Chachamim* here.

More rules regarding compensatory prayers:

**טענה ולא התפלל** – The Rabbis taught in a Baraisa: **מנחה בערב שבת** – If one erred and did not pray Minchah on the eve of the Sabbath, i.e. on Friday afternoon, **מתפלל בליל** – he prays twice on the Sabbath night, once for Maariv and once to make up for Minchah.<sup>[1]</sup>  
**טענה ולא התפלל מנחה בשבת** – If one erred and did not recite Minchah on the Sabbath, **מתפלל במוצאי שבת שתיים של חול** – he prays at the conclusion of the Sabbath, i.e. on Saturday night, two of the weekday, i.e. two weekday texts of the Prayer, one for Maariv and one to make up for Minchah.<sup>[2]</sup>  
**מבדיל בראשונה ואינו מבדיל בשנייה** – He recites Havdalah in the first Prayer but he does not recite Havdalah in the second.<sup>[3]</sup>  
**ואם הבדיל בשנייה ולא הבדיל בראשונה** – And if he recited Havdalah in the second Prayer but he did not recite Havdalah in the first, **שניה עלתה לו** – the second one counts for him, **ראשונה לא עלתה לו** – and the first one does not count for him.<sup>[4]</sup>

The Gemara asks:

**למימרא דכיון דלא אבדיל בקמייתא** – Is this to say that since he did not recite Havdalah in the first Prayer **במאן דלא עלי דמי** – in what manner is he not liable?

**it is as if he did not pray it and we make him repeat it?**<sup>[5]</sup> **ורמינהו** – But contrast [this Baraisa with another] and note the contradiction: **טענה ולא הזכיר גבורות גשמים בתחיית** – If one erred and did not mention the powers of rain in the blessing of **THE RESURRECTION OF THE DEAD**,<sup>[6]</sup> **OR THE REQUEST for rain in the blessing OF THE YEARS**,<sup>[7]</sup> **מחזירין אותו** – we make him return and repeat the *Shemoneh Esrei*.<sup>[8]</sup> **הבדלה בחונן הדעת** – However, if he forgot to recite **HAVDALAH** in the blessing **GRACIOUS GIVER OF WISDOM**,<sup>[9]</sup> **אין מחזירין אותו** – we do not make him return, **מפני שיוכל לאומרה על הכוס** – for he is able to say [Havdalah] later over the cup of wine.<sup>[10]</sup> Thus we see that the omission of Havdalah does not invalidate the *Shemoneh Esrei*. – ? –

The Gemara concludes:

**קשיא** – This is indeed a difficulty.<sup>[11]</sup>

The Gemara discusses the origin of the three daily Prayers:

**רבי יוסי קריב חנינא אמר** – It was said: **איתמר** – It was said: **תפלות אבות תקנו** – The prayers were instituted by the Patriarchs.<sup>[12]</sup> **רבי יהושע בן לוי אמר** – R' Yehoshua ben Levi said: **תפלות בנגיד תמידין תקנו** – The

#### NOTES

1. He recites the Sabbath text of the *Shemoneh Esrei* both times. For the reason the Sabbath Prayers were shortened from eighteen blessings to seven was that the Sages wished to make the Sabbath Prayers simpler and less burdensome (see above, 21a). Accordingly, whenever one prays on the Sabbath, even if he is making up for a weekday Prayer, he recites the Sabbath text (*Ritva*; see also *Hagahos HaGra*).

2. Although he is making up for a Sabbath Prayer, he still recites the weekday text of the *Shemoneh Esrei*. For even on the Sabbath itself the *Shemoneh Esrei* should have been identical to the weekday one [with just an appropriate paragraph included to indicate the holiness of the day, as is done on Rosh Chodesh and Chol HaMoed by adding **ויעלה ויבא**]. As mentioned, however, the Sages wished to make the Sabbath Prayer less burdensome. Accordingly, where the person is making up for a Sabbath Prayer after the Sabbath, the reason no longer applies, and he recites the weekday text of the *Shemoneh Esrei* (*Ritva*; see *Tosafos*).

3. [Havdalah here refers to the **אקה חונקת** prayer inserted into the fourth blessing of the *Shemoneh Esrei* of Maariv at the conclusion of the Sabbath, to signify the differentiation between the Sabbath and the other days of the week.] When compensating for a missed *tefillah*, the first *Shemoneh Esrei* is always recited for the current obligation and the second for the missed one. [For possible reasons for this, see *Maadanei Yom Tov* §400; *Aruch HaShulchan* 108:9; *Mishnah Berurah* 108:7.] Accordingly, when compensating on Saturday night for a missed Sabbath Minchah Prayer, one adds Havdalah to the first *Shemoneh Esrei*, since this one is for the current Maariv obligation, but not to the second *Shemoneh Esrei*, since this is the compensatory Prayer (see *Rashi*).

[This is unlike the law in the first case in which one is compensating for a missed weekday Prayer on the Sabbath, where we learned that one recites the exact same *Shemoneh Esrei* both times. This is because Havdalah is not part of the Saturday night *Shemoneh Esrei* per se, but is merely inserted into that *Shemoneh Esrei* to differentiate between the holiness of the Sabbath and the weekday. Accordingly, once it is recited in the first *Shemoneh Esrei* and the differentiation has been made, there is no reason to recite it again in the second *Shemoneh Esrei* (*Maadanei Yom Tov* §200).]

4. The second *Shemoneh Esrei* counts as Maariv, while the first *Shemoneh Esrei* does not count at all. The person must therefore recite a third *Shemoneh Esrei* to make up for Minchah.

The reason for this is as follows: When he recited the first of the two *Shemoneh Esreis*, he presumably had in mind that he was doing so to fulfill his current Maariv obligation, for the rule is that one must always recite the current obligation first. However, since he did not add Havdalah, which he was required to do for the Maariv Prayer, it does not count for him.

He then recited the second *Shemoneh Esrei*. [Although he has not yet fulfilled his Maariv obligation, and we have learned that the present obligation must always be discharged first, in this case where he in fact intended the first *Shemoneh Esrei* for the current obligation, but did not

fulfill it because of a halachic technicality (i.e. he forgot Havdalah), he theoretically can recite the second *Shemoneh Esrei* for his make-up (see *Rashash*). However] by adding Havdalah to this second *Shemoneh Esrei*, he has indicated that he is in fact reciting this *Shemoneh Esrei* for his current obligation (presumably because he realized that he had forgotten Havdalah in the first *Shemoneh Esrei*). It therefore does not count as a compensatory prayer, but, indeed, for the present obligation. Accordingly, he must now recite *Shemoneh Esrei* a third time to make up for the Sabbath Minchah Prayer (*Rashi*, as explained by *Hagahos HaBach*; for other explanations of *Rashi's* commentary here see *Leshon HaZahav*, *Divrei David* and *Emes LeYaakov*; cf. *Ritva*).

5. As explained in the previous note, the reason the first *Shemoneh Esrei* does not count for his Maariv obligation was because he left out Havdalah. Thus, the Baraisa must be assuming that omitting Havdalah in the Saturday night *Shemoneh Esrei* invalidates that Prayer.

6. That is, he neglected during the winter months to mention the phrase **משיב דבר ומוריד הגשם**, *He makes the wind blow and the rain descend*, in the second blessing of the *Shemoneh Esrei*, which speaks about the resurrection of the dead.

7. That is, during the rainy season he did not mention the phrase **טל וקטר**, *and give dew and rain*, in the ninth blessing of *Shemoneh Esrei*, which concludes *Blessed are You, Hashem, Who blesses the years*.

8. [For the details of these laws see *Orach Chaim* 114:5 and 117:4.]

9. That is, on Saturday night he did not add the Havdalah prayer into the fourth blessing of *Shemoneh Esrei*, which is the blessing asking God for wisdom.

10. Since Havdalah is recited a second time over a cup of wine, there is no need to repeat *Shemoneh Esrei* if one left out Havdalah there. [As to why Havdalah is recited twice, see below, 33a.]

11. Although the Gemara leaves this difficulty unresolved, the fact that the Gemara concludes with the expression **קשיא**, *a difficulty*, rather than with the more forceful expression **תייבא**, *a refutation*, indicates that the Gemara does not mean to reject the Baraisa's ruling, but means only to state that it cannot at present resolve the difficulty it raised with that ruling (see *Rav Hai Gaon* cited by *Rosh*; see also *Rashi* to *Sanhedrin* 72a; cf. *Rashbam* to *Bava Basra* 52b; *קשיא* (ר"ה) in fact, the law as cited in *Shulchan Aruch* (*Orach Chaim* 108:10) is in accord with this Baraisa. Moreover, *Rav Hai Gaon* offers a plausible reason for the Baraisa's ruling: By reciting Havdalah in the second *Shemoneh Esrei* [but not in the first], the person indicated that he intended the first Prayer as his make-up and the second for the current obligation. Since a make-up may never precede a current obligation, the first Prayer is invalid and the person must recite the make-up Prayer a second time.

12. As a Baraisa below will explain (*Rashi*). [This does not mean that the Patriarchs composed the text of the *Shemoneh Esrei* as we have it, for this was formulated many generations later by the **אנשי כנסת הגדולה**, *Men of the Great Assembly* (see *Megillah* 17b-18a). Rather, the Patriarchs